Counter-Trafficking in Persons (C-TIP) Expert Assessment Report





Counter-Trafficking in Persons (C-TIP) Expert Assessment Report

Data for Impact

University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill 123 West Franklin Street, Suite 330 Chapel Hill, NC 27516 USA Phone: 919-445-9350 | Fax: 919-445-9353 D4l@unc.edu http://www.data4impactproject.org This publication was produced with the support of the United States Agency for International Development (USAID) under the terms of the Data for Impact (D4I) associate award 7200AA18LA00008, which is implemented by the Carolina Population Center at the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill, in partnership with Palladium International, LLC; ICF Macro, Inc.; John Snow, Inc.; and Tulane University. The views expressed in this publication do not necessarily reflect the views of USAID or the United States government.

TR-22-487 D4I

June 2022





Contents

Figures4
Tables4
Abbreviations
Executive Summary
Methodology
Recommendations7
Introduction
Counter-Trafficking in Persons in Armenia
Emerging issues in the context of COVID-19 and their impact on Human Trafficking and Exploitation
Socio-economic situation
Unemployment10
Conflict10
Cyber misuse10
Objectives of the study 11
Methods12
C-TIP NAP Assessment Limitations13
Results14
Ideal Flow of Counter-trafficking in Person and Exploitation Efforts in three phases17
Phase 1. Early detection/initial identification and referral17
Phase 2. Identification and parallel criminal proceedings/opening a criminal case18
Phase 3. Identification and parallel criminal proceedings/opening a criminal case19
Status of 2020–2022 NAP implementation
C-TIP NAP Implementation progress as assessed by relevant actors
Performance by chapter as reported by the C-TIP Actors21
Conclusions and Recommendations
Recommendations
Summary Recommendation40
Appendices
I. Case studies and the As-Is Business Process
II. Assessment tools and consent

Figures

Figure 1: 2020–2022 NAP Implementation Score	20
Figure 2: Chapter 2 Performance by Objective	23

Tables

Table 1: Data Collection Framework	12
Table 2: 2021 Identified victims by origin	36
Table 3: Existing Data Collection Systems related to TIP	36
Table 4: Summary recommendations by chapter	40

Abbreviations

AMD	Armenian Dram
ATU	Anti-Trafficking Unit
CIS	Commonwealth of Independent States
CSO	Civil Society Organization
C-TIP	Countering trafficking-in-persons
D4I	Data for Impact
GOAM	Government of Armenia
HLIB	Health and Labor Inspection Body
KII	Key Informant Interview
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MOLSA	Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs
NAP	National Action Plan
NGO	Non-governmental Organization
NRM	National Referral Mechanism
PGO	Prosecutor General's Office
ROA	Republic of Armenia
THB	Trafficking in Human Beings
TIP	Trafficking in Persons
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
USD	United States Dollar
WG	Working Group

Executive Summary

The Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs (MOLSA) with support from the United States Agency for International Development (USAID) Data for Impact (D4I) project assessed progress of counter-trafficking in persons (C-TIP) aspects of the 2020–2022 National Action Plan (NAP). The report provides evidence-based recommendations to improve C-TIP programming and to better monitor implementation through standardized indicators and performance measures. As part of the assessment, MOLSA and D4I completed a review of the C-TIP monitoring and evaluation system capacity. The assessment established the types of human trafficking cases in Armenia and categorized them, evaluated the series of steps performed by the counter-trafficking person and exploitation of person actors engaged in C-TIP in Armenia (also known as business processes) as envisioned by the NAP, outlined the current steps and practices, and recommended the ideal process.

This report outlines the status of the activities described under each chapter of the NAP and highlights the gaps and challenges to be addressed:

- **Section 1** provides a brief background of the situation of counter-trafficking in persons in Armenia, emerging issues and their impact on human trafficking and exploitation, and assessment objectives.
- **Section 2** describes the C-TIP business process in Armenia using case studies detailing actions taken, and then proposes the ideal chronology for managing the case.
- Section 3 details the status of the C-TIP 2020–2022 NAP implementation monitoring. The overall implementation rating as scored by the national C-TIP stakeholders was 86 percent although the expert analysis does not agree with the high scores on NAP implementation for the year 2021. Much of the scoring by the national actors was subjective and recommendations were made from both the national C-TIP actors and experts for consideration for adoption during the next NAP development which is scheduled to start in June 2022.

Methodology

The methods used to conduct the assessment relied on stakeholder engagement to understand from an operational perspective—the progress, barriers, and enablers of C-TIP implementation in the period under study. The assessment used a mixed methods approach to collect quantitative and qualitative data at the group and individual levels. A group assessment tool, case studies, and keyinformant interviews (KIIs) were the primary data collection methods employed. The MOLSA Division of Counter -trafficking and Women's Issues and C-TIP national actors responded to the group assessment tool that sought to establish the status of implementation of the 2021 National Action Plan (NAP). The tool had employed a Likert scale of 1–4. The group assessment tool was validated during a C-TIP Inter-Agency Working Group (WG) workshop held February 18–19, 2022, which was organized by the D4I C-TIP project in collaboration with MOLSA. KII were held with the same cohort of respondents and a select number of other key C-TIP stakeholders. Data were collected between February 1–16, 2022. The tools were supplemented by a desk review of documents relevant to MOLSA C-TIP and Women Affairs division. Recommended actions identified by the assessment were discussed and prioritized jointly with workshop participants.

Recommendations

The C-TIP NAP expert assessment recommendations consolidate the national stakeholders' participatory group inputs, self-assessment actions, and the expert analysis for adoption during the next NAP formulation. These include but are not limited to:

- Establish an M&E system with performance indicators and outcomes to be used for regular tracking of counter-trafficking in persons and counter-exploitation of persons. When developing the next NAP, ensure that performance monitoring indicators and targets for all planned activities are clearly defined and included in the C-TIP M&E plan.
- Develop and review data collection tools (manual or electronic) for C-TIP actors and agencies to use. Develop a set of variables for integration into existing data collection tools and Information Systems, particularly in the Social Needs Assessment Questionnaire for Children in Adversity, Family Needs Assessment questionnaires for case managers in Unified Social Services, and Assessment tools for Community Social Workers, Employment Service Employees, etc.
- Strengthen role of M&E in C-TIP NAP planning and implementation by developing a working C-TIP M&E plan document.
- Identify and prioritize capacity-strengthening activities for MOLSA and other actors on C-TIP data management and detail them in a M&E capacity-strengthening plan for the division.
- Evaluate C-TIP cases and their outcomes for initiating required steps by relevant national agencies.
- Strengthen the M&E capacity of relevant agencies: MOLSA Division of Counter -Trafficking and Women's Issues and stakeholders such as the Health and Labor Inspection Body (HLIB), social workers, and community actors.
- Enhance partnerships and collaboration among other agencies and stakeholders for activities such as review and dissemination of handbooks for social workers.
- Create mechanisms for sharing information among C-TIP actors to help make referral processes more effective and victim¹-centered.
- Develop and disseminate information products that focus on subjects such as human trafficking and labor exploitation to increase awareness among the public, state, and non-state employees at all levels.
- Institutionalize a collaboration meeting among C-TIP partners.
- Establish a sustainable capacity-strengthening framework that includes a curriculum for training and sensitization for agencies involved in the protection and support of trafficked persons. Develop guidelines for training relevant cadres of the social workforce.

¹ We acknowledge the term *survivor* as the preferred term, but in keeping with GOAM's usage we maintained *victim* in this brief.

Introduction

The Government of Armenia (GOAM) has demonstrated a clear commitment to counter trafficking-in-persons (C-TIP) activities by signing various conventions as established by the counter-trafficking in-persons report, 2021 (USAID D4I, 2021). Internationally, the GOAM has joined the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime, the Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, especially Women and Children (also called the Palermo Protocol, ratified by the GOAM in 2003) and the Council of Europe Convention on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings (ratified by the GOAM in 2008). The country has signed and ratified several conventions addressing slavery and forced labor such as the ILO Forced Labor Convention No.29 (ratified in 2004), the ILO Convention on the Abolition of Forced Labor No.105 (ratified in 2004), the ILO Convention on Worst Forms of Child Labor No.182 (ratified in 2006), as well as the UN Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (ratified in 1993). Additionally, in September 2013 Armenia signed but has not yet ratified the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of all Migrant Workers and Members of their Families.

At the regional level, Armenia has signed an Agreement on Co-operation between Commonwealth of Independent States (CIS) member States in Combating Trafficking in Persons, Human Organs, and Tissues (2005), the Program of Cooperation between the CIS Member States against Trafficking in Persons for 2014–2018, and the Interagency Agreement on Co-operation in the Sphere of Organizing Execution of Criminal Punishments.

Counter-Trafficking in Persons in Armenia

Armenia is a country of both origin and destination for human trafficking. The GOAM is making efforts to combat trafficking in persons through several initiatives, including streamlined oversight management and implementation of and reporting on counter -trafficking activities to the Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs (MOLSA), specifically its Division of Counter-Trafficking and Women's Issues at the Department for Securing Equal Opportunities. The GOAM has established an institutional framework between state agencies and non-state actors to align counter-trafficking activities in the country.² Given its demonstrated efforts to initiate policy, institutional and legislative measures to mitigate and respond to human trafficking more effectively, Armenia was upgraded from Tier 2 Watch List (in 2020) to Tier 2³ in the US State Department's annual TIP report of 2021.

Regarding the institutional Counter-trafficking framework in Armenia:

a) The Inter-Ministerial Council to Combat Trafficking in Human Beings (hereinafter referred to as the Inter-Ministerial Council) was set up in 2007 by the Prime Minister's Decree 861-N. The latest Decree of the Prime Minister of the RoA on the composition of the Inter-Ministerial Council, dated February 22, 2022,⁴ appoints one of the Deputy Prime Ministers as the Chair of the Council and provides a list of the council members drawn from the

² https://rm.coe.int/16806ff1ad.

³ Tier 2: Countries whose governments do not fully meet the TVPA's minimum standards but are making significant efforts to bring themselves into compliance with those standards; US State Department's annual report- 2021.

⁴ https://www.e-gov.am/u_files/file/decrees/varch/2022/203_1.pdf

ministries and other state agencies. The Council is tasked with developing a policy for combating trafficking in human beings and exploitation and provide leadership and general coordination of activities implemented by all relevant government agencies and civil society organizations involved in countering human trafficking.

- b) The Inter-agency Counter-trafficking Working Group (Inter-agency WG), a multidisciplinary group of government representatives, national and international NGOs, and international organizations, is chaired by the Head of the MOLSA Department for Securing Equal Opportunities. The Inter-agency WG operates under the Council and ensures operational coordination, including in the implementation of the three-year NAPs, and reports to the Inter-Ministerial Council through MOLSA.
- c) Trafficking Victims Identification Commission is chaired by MOLSA and consists of representatives of MOLSA, Prosecutor's Office, Police, and two specialized NGOs (UMCOR and Hope and Help). The Commission is tasked with identifying the individuals as victims of trafficking and referring them for required assistance and support.

This report aims to contribute to the efforts of the national C-TIP actors to improve monitoring of National Action Plan (NAP) implementation. It addresses most of the priority recommendations of the US State Department 2021 TIP report, covering the 4Ps: Prosecution, Prevention, Protection, and Partnership under the umbrella of the Armenian Government's current three-year NAP key provisions.

Emerging issues in the context of COVID-19 and their impact on Human Trafficking and Exploitation

The rapid spread of coronavirus (COVID-19) globally has had significant effects on the socioeconomic situation of nations and their people. In Armenia, the first case of COVID-19) was reported on March 1, 2020, and the Prime Minister subsequently announced measures such as cancellation of social events, and limitation of border crossings, to prevent the spread of the virus. As the pandemic continued, the public health measures and border restrictions put in place to combat the spread of COVID-19 had other effects on the country's populace. There was a rise in prices resulting in increased inflation. COVID-19 became another stressor leading to increased unemployment, food insecurity, and poverty.

Socio-economic situation

According to the 2021 World Bank report on Armenia,⁵ the COVID-19 pandemic has caused welfare losses through declines in labor income, remittances and private transfers, supply chain disruptions, and business closure. Projections based on distribution-neutral growth assumptions suggest that the upper-middle-income poverty rate has increased by 6.6 percent between 2019 and 2020. The effects of the pandemic on households' incomes suggest that poverty could increase 8.4–9.4 percentage points compared to 2019. Although the economy was expected to gradually recover starting from 2021, in the absence of appropriate policy measures, the effects of COVID-19 and the

⁵ https://databank.worldbank.org/data/download/poverty/987B9C90-CB9F-4D93-AE8C-

⁷⁵⁰⁵⁸⁸BF00QA/AM2021/Global_POVEQ_ARM.pdf

2020 Nagorno-Karabakh armed conflict⁶ may have long-term consequences on poverty and inequality, human capital, household vulnerability, and gender gaps.⁷

A recent study by ILO in 2021⁸ established that acute exposure and vulnerability of the Armenian labor force to the immediate impacts of the COVID-19 crisis reveals a lack of resilient systems, resulting from limited social protection and weak employment laws.

Unemployment

Per the ILO report, Armenia's unemployment rate has reduced from 19 percent in 2018 to 15 percent in 2021. However, it is the highest of all Eurasian Economic Union (EEU) countries. Given the high unemployment rate and large number of job seekers, the shadow labor market makes it possible for some individuals to offer jobs avoiding legal labor market standards, such as minimum wages, maximum working hours, safety standards, etc. This may increase the risk of forced labor and labor exploitation among groups that are seeking employment both inside Armenia and outside the country (mostly men). At-risk groups of women and children (those with mental health issues, the economically vulnerable, etc.) can be exploited for both sex and labor within the country. Other nationals are also at risk of sex trafficking, especially women of Ukrainian, Belarusian, Uzbek, Chinese and Russian origin working as dancers in Armenian nightclubs. Another group of foreign citizens (mostly Iranian and Indian migrants) seeks employment in the informal sector and may be subject to exploitation in forced labor by the traffickers. Other subgroups such as men in rural areas with low educational attainment and children residing in childcare institutions also remain highly vulnerable to labor exploitation and sex trafficking among this populace.

Conflict

Armenia's first Nagorno-Karabakh conflict occurred in 1988–1994, and conflict erupted again in September 2020. It lasted for six weeks during the COVID-19 pandemic, exacerbating the effects of the pandemic, and causing displacement of civilians. The pressures that the pandemic brought together with the sobering effects of the war have placed a significant burden on Armenians in need and increased their vulnerabilities.

According to the State Employment Agency of Armenia, as of January 2021, most of the persons registered as unemployed were women. Women make up 64.7% of the total number of unemployed (40,200 people), young people make up 19.1% (11,900 people), and people with disabilities make up 3.9% (2,400 people).

Cyber misuse

The COVID-19 pandemic increased the use of virtual spaces, introducing increased risks of cybercrimes and misuse of information and communications technologies to facilitate human trafficking. As a result of increased restrictions due to COVID-19, online communication increased

⁶ The armed conflict in the disputed region of Nagorno-Karabakh and the surrounding territories. The main combatants were Azerbaijan, with support from Turkey and foreign mercenary groups, on one side, and the self-proclaimed Republic of Artsakh and Armenia on the other. The war was marked by the deployment of drones, sensors, long-range heavy artillery, and missile strikes, as well as by state propaganda and the use of official social media accounts in online information warfare.

⁷ https://databank.worldbank.org/data/download/poverty/987B9C90-CB9F-4D93-AE8C-

⁷⁵⁰⁵⁸⁸BF00QA/AM2021/Global POVEQ ARM.pdf

⁸ https://www.ilo.org/moscow/information-resources/publications/WCMS 762029/lang--en/index.htm

risks of cybercrimes. The ways and means of misuse of internet, the new ways that traffickers applied to target potential victims, increased the latency of the crime. In 2020, no person was charged for sexual exploitation and three people were charged for labor exploitation, while in 2021 the picture was different: eight people were charged for sex trafficking and three for labor exploitation.

Objectives of the study

The D4I and the MOLSA Division of Counter-Trafficking and Women's Issues collaborated to conduct a comprehensive assessment of the counter-trafficking in persons National Plan of Action implementation and its M&E system. The objectives of the assessment were as follows:

- Establish the types of human trafficking cases in Armenia and categorize them
- Evaluate steps performed by stakeholders to achieve concrete goals (also known as the business processes) as envisioned by the NAP
- Establish the progress made towards implementation of the 2020–2022 NAP implementation and provide evidence-based recommendations to inform the development of the next NAP
- Evaluate MOLSA and C-TIP actors' routine data collection processes, and data use for national-level reporting and improvement of C-TIP responses (M&E system)

The research questions were:

- What are the types and categories of human trafficking cases in Armenia?
- What are the steps performed by stakeholders to achieve concrete goals envisioned by the 2020–2022 NAP?
- What progress has MOLSA, and the C-TIP stakeholders made in the implementation of the 2020–2022 NAP?
- What are MOLSA and C-TIP actors' routine data collection processes and data use approaches?

Methods

The assessment employed a mixed methods approach to collect quantitative and qualitative data at the group and individual level. The tools sought to collect information about participants' experiences implementing the C-TIP activities, their engagement with systems that exist to guide C-TIP processes, and the current C-TIP implementation environment in Armenia.

A group assessment tool, case studies, and key-informant interviews (KIIs) were the primary data collection methods used, and data was collected between February 1–16, 2022. Primary data collection was supplemented by desk review of documents relevant to MOLSA C-TIP and Women Affairs. Additionally, the **group assessment tool** was validated during an organized participatory meeting—the C-TIP Inter-Agency Working Group (WG) workshop held February 18–19, 2022, organized by the D4I C-TIP project in collaboration with MOLSA. Recommendations and actions identified by the assessment were discussed and prioritized jointly with workshop participants.

Method	Description	Objective
Desk analysis and literature review	Legislation frameworks for C-TIP, secondary analysis of surveys, other reports, and documents were reviewed. The list of the reviewed documents is in the appendix.	To provide secondary data and context of the C-TIP situation in Armenia.
Focus Group Discussion (FGDs)	Four FGDs were conducted for the national actors. These were for Police Services (Division for Fight against Trafficking at the Department for Crimes against Human Beings and Property; all four participants were male); Investigative committee—one female and two male participants, Identification Commission four female and three male participants-, the NGO Group— one male and three female participants (UMCOR, Democracy Today, Hope and Help). Data were obtained from a purposely selected group of individuals/organizations who are instrumental in C-TIP implementation in Armenia.	The qualitative approach is used to gain an in- depth understanding of C-TIP implementation in Armenia.
Key Informant Interviews (KII)	Ten interviews were conducted either physically or virtually with identified stakeholders drawn from actors/agencies collaborating directly with victims, local, regional, national-level authorities, and organizations, including meetings with key agencies. Total number of C-TIP actors in Armenia =25 but only 10 were interviewed. Out of the 10 interviewed, 6 were male and 4 were female.	To identify types of trafficking in Armenia and a series of steps performed by the C-TIP stakeholders (business processes) to address a trafficking or labour exploitation case.

Table 1: Data collection framework

Method	Description	Objective
Group assessment	One participatory group assessment toolkit was applied with the national C-TIP actors.	To build group consensus around results for each NAP activity assessment statement using a 4-point scale.
Case studies	Three case types were identified as documented in Armenia and were used to provide in-depth information on the business process of the specific category. In 2021, there were 31 reported cases. [Source: MOLSA]	To identify the process flow of trafficking in and exploitation of persons, the at-risk groups, and the stakeholders who handle specific steps of the cases.

C-TIP NAP Assessment Limitations

The main assessment limitations were:

- The 2020–2022 NAP does not have objective performance monitoring indicators, which meant that the assessment relied on subjective review of the implementation progress. The National C-TIP actors engaged in the assessment provided high implementation progress scores with very little variation, which may indicate problems with the measures.
- There is high turnover among the C-TIP working group members, most of whom are new to the field and have limited knowledge and practice. Thus, it impacted in providing the correct status of the 2020–2022 NAP implementation during the period of review as they could not respond to the statements fully and accurately.
- NAP was implemented late and differently and required modifications to the approaches which had an impact in measuring the earlier intended progress thus the study was limited in getting the planned outcome.

Results

The C-TIP expert assessment sought to explore the categories of TIP cases that are reported in Armenia. Using two hypothetical situations as case studies,⁹ the assessment explored the steps that stakeholders follow when handling a suspected human trafficking and exploitation case. The case studies are detailed in Appendix B.

The assessment compared the current steps that actors employ with the predetermined ideal. As presented in Table 1, all presumed TIP cases should be referred to MOLSA/Identification Commission for the determination of the status of the presumed victims from a social protection perspective. The first responders and agencies that most commonly screen and disclose these cases are: Unified Social Services, Police, Investigative Committee, Prosecutor's office, Child daycare centers and National Security Service. The cases that are not categorized as crimes but pose a high risk of further escalation, are referred as well for social support and risk management.

	Ideal business processes for C-TIP actors' intervention in trafficking cases se I: Early Detection, Initial identification, and referral	Expected Services for the victims
a) b) c) d) e) If the	 b 1: Reporting a trafficking case Victim reports a case to the Police, other Law enforcement (LE) agencies, NGO, etc (self-reporting), and the case is then sent to the Police HQs Specialized division. Mass media: can be used to highlight a case that is then picked by the Police or the Investigative Committee. Next of kin or other family member reports the case to the authorities (e.g., Police, other LE agencies, MOLSA, NGO, etc.) Frontline specialist/doctor, community social worker, and teacher report the case to the Police. The local police officers collect the evidence as reported in the local stations and refer the case and then report to the central authority, a specialized division at the Head Office of Police. e location of the presumed victim is unknown, the police take the direct steps to find the person. 	 The presumed victim has access to the relevant unit(s) to be identified for protection and other social assistance. Early needs assessment is conducted by the Identification Commission to start providing urgent assistance. The victims are provided with comprehensive information about their rights through direct contact with specialized NGO/s.
Ster a) b)	 Description 2: Police screening and referral of a trafficking case If there is enough evidence, the police open a criminal case and conduct the first meeting with the presumed victim to assess the situation and the risks. The Police conduct an initial screening to identify urgent needs, including accommodation and safety-related, and apply protection measures if necessary. 	 The presumed victim gets the required urgent support and protection. They are offered temporary accommodation. Required safety measures are taken for his/her protection. They access to communication, including mobile telephone, ensuring, however, that the traffickers have no possibility to contact the victim. They get required assistance and protection, including new documents if the latter is lost.

Table 2: Ideal business processes flow for counter-trafficking

⁹ Cases used in the assessment centered on sex trafficking and assumed child labor exploitation

	1
c) The Police share the information regarding the presumed victim	
to MOLSA for further identification and referral for assistance to	
the specialized NGO.	
d) If the documents of the presumed victim are lost or kept by the	
trafficker, the Police take measures to restore the documentation	
(passport, personal ID, etc)	
e) The Police refer the case to the RoA Investigative Committee	
NB: Information sharing from Police to MOLSA goes as prescribed by	
the RoA legislation.	
Phase 2: Identification, Parallel Criminal Proceedings and opening	of a Criminal Case
Step 3: Identification Commission (IC), based on the	Identification of the victim and assistance
documentation received:	
a) The MOLSA representative chairing the IC prepares a package	• The presumed victim, once identified as a
to present the case for identification of the victim(s) and referral	trafficked victim, enjoys the rights as prescribed
to support services.	the national legislation and gets access to
b) MOLSA invites all members of the Identification Commission to	services and assistance.
a meeting.	
c) MOLSA chairs the session and prepares the drafts of the	
decisions, then circulates those for approval by the Members.	
d) MOLSA prepares a referral letter and shares the information	
with the NGO delegated by the Ministry to provide support	
services to victims.	
e) Based on initial needs assessment and as required, the IC	
refers the presumed or actual victim to the agencies providing	
respective urgent services (e.g. medical institutes, etc.).	
Step 4: The Investigative Committee, based on the referred	The presumed victim gets the criminal procedural
criminal case by the Police:	status of a trafficked victim with all rights and
a) Conducts full investigation.	responsibilities as prescribed by the criminal-
b) Submits a request to the court on arresting the accused person.	procedural legislation.
c) Identifies the person as a trafficking victim within the criminal	The victim gets access to legal protection during t
procedure.	whole criminal procedure and trial, through the publc
d) Interviews the victim and gets all required evidence to present to	defender's support or the NGO's legal support.
the court.	The victim gets is informed on his/her right to prest
e) Presents the complete investigation package to the court for the	a compensation charge to the court and to get
judicial trial.	compensation from the trafficker.
Phase 3: Assistance and reintegration services	
Step 5: NGOs delegated by MOLSA to provide required services as	Victim gets access to safe accommodation
prescribed by the national legislation.	(shelter) and proper living conditions, based on
	age-specific requirements.
a) Provide accommodation if required such as food, and	They are supported to restore contacts with the
necessary items for the victim.	family and community.
b) Conduct a comprehensive needs assessment for the victim.	Victim gets access to education, vocational
c) Prepares a rehabilitation/reintegration plan for the victim.	training, and employment.
d) Prepares a plan of activities for following up with the victim.	

e)	Ensure the victim's participation in a judicial trial by providing transportation, logistics, and legal support.
f)	Provide medical services, psycho-social services, vocational training, paying special attention to the needs of the child victims, including their school attendance.
g)	If necessary, provide out-of-shelter services to victims who prefer to live on their own.
h)	Regularly report to MOLSA about the victim.
i)	Conduct follow-up to re-integration activities after the victim
	leaves the shelter, also through supporting them to find
	employment.

Ideal Flow of Counter-trafficking in Person and Exploitation Efforts in three phases

Phase 1. Early detection/initial identification and referral

C-TIP — Counter-Tracking Process

Phase 1. Early detection/initial identification and referral



Phase 2. Identification and parallel criminal proceedings/opening a criminal case

C-TIP — Counter-Tracking Process

Phase 2. Identification and parallel criminal proceedings/opening a criminal case



Phase 3. Identification and parallel criminal proceedings/opening a criminal case

C-TIP — Counter-Tracking Process

Phase 3. Assistance, support services and reintegration parallel conviction and compensation

î



Status of 2020–2022 NAP implementation

C-TIP NAP Implementation progress as assessed by relevant actors

The 2020–2022 NAP has six chapters:

- i) Improving the legislation to fight against trafficking in and exploitation of persons
- ii) Prevention of trafficking in and exploitation of persons
- iii) Prevention of trafficking in and exploitation of children
- iv) Detection, protection, and support to persons subjected to trafficking and exploitation
- v) International cooperation
- vi) Surveys, monitoring, and evaluation

Implementation progress assessment used a NAP Implementation score derived by getting a percentage of the total score for chapter and dividing it by the maximum score for all activities in each NAP chapter. Performance scores were graded as poor if between 0–25 percent, low if between 26–50 percent, 51–76 percent were good while above 75 percent were excellent. Overall, the MOLSA–C-TIP program has an implementation progress score of 86 percent in the year 2021. Figure 4 shows the implementation progress score under each of the chapters. Chapter 4 recorded the highest level of implementation (100%), followed by chapters 3, 5, and 6 with a score of 88%.

The following section of the report provides details on results for each chapter and outlines any implementation gaps identified.



Figure 1: 2020–2022 NAP Implementation Score

Performance by chapter as reported by the C-TIP Actors

Chapter I. Improving the legislation to fight against trafficking in and exploitation of persons

Chapter 1 of the 2020–2022 NAP revolves around taking steps to directly or indirectly improve the legislation related to combating human trafficking and ensure the enforceability of the legal provisions. Strengthening institutional mechanisms for both revising and enforcing these pieces of legislation is another key objective of this chapter. Many of the US 2021 TIP report recommendations for Armenia address the need to advance legislative responses to trafficking.

This chapter identifies nine tasks to be implemented during the three years (2020–2022) of the current NAP. These tasks are listed below, along with findings related to their implementation. Out of the four activities to be implemented in FY2021, the implementation rate was rated excellent with a score of 81 percent with only one task delayed from starting as planned.

C1.1.1: Develop recommendations aimed at introducing the term "forced labor" in the RoA Labor Code and create mechanisms to enforce it.

• During the reporting period, MOLSA and the Health and Labor Inspection Body (HLIB submitted proposals to the National Assembly to make amendments to the RoA Labor Code to introducing the term "forced labor."

C1.1.2: Develop the by-laws of the RoA Trafficking and Exploitation Victims Identification Commission and adopt the draft RoA Government Decree amending and supplementing Government Decree 1200-N (dated October 15, 2015) on Amending and Supplementing the Government Decree that defines the form of the report presented by the Trafficking and Exploitation Victims Identification Commission to the Republic of Armenia Council for Fighting Trafficking in and Exploitation of Persons.

• MOLSA submitted drafts of the by-laws aimed at improving the operations of the trafficking and exploitation victims Identification Commission to the government. MOLSA, Division of Counter - trafficking and Women's Issues by adopting a government decree that defines the form used to in reporting by the Trafficking and Exploitation Victims Identification Commission to the Inter-Ministerial Council

C.1.1.5: Review the procedures available in the RoA Criminal and Civil Procedure Codes for providing victims with compensation for damage inflicted by the crime and, if necessary, submit a legislative proposal.

• The Ministry of Justice conducted a study on the relevant provisions on compensation for victims of crime in the RA Criminal and Civil Procedure Codes. The results of the study show that the provisions on compensation for damage caused by a crime under the draft Criminal Procedure Code and the current Civil Procedure Code comply with international standards. The recommendation by the Ministry of Justice is to adhere to the procedures as there is no legislative proposal needed to make any amendments.

C.1.1.10: Amend the Law on the Identification and Support of Persons Subjected to Trafficking and Exploitation to specify and safeguard the source of funding necessary for repatriation of RoA citizens trafficked in foreign states.

• The package of amendments to this law has been submitted by MOLSA to the ministry of Foreign Affairs and it outlines the minimum standards of the required services to be provided to persons

subjected to trafficking and exploitation. The amendment stipulates that the identification committee to develop and implement indicators for preliminary designation of presumed victims.

- The review recommended that Ministry of Justice institutes another amendment to the Law¹⁰ that will specify the source and allocate funding for repatriation of RoA citizens trafficked in foreign states. As reported by the MFA, no financial resources were allocated in 2021 for the mentioned activity.
- The RA Ministry of Foreign Affairs did not submit a package of relevant legislative drafts as presented by MOLSA.

Gaps

- There is a need to develop authorizing norms (sub-laws/secondary legislation) for improving enforcement of the counter -trafficking law (Law of Identification of and Support to Victims of Trafficking and Exploitation)
- SA toolkit is needed to help strengthen C-TIP actors' capacity to identify forced labor
- A legal framework is needed that will allow law enforcement agencies to share information with MOLSA and apply referral mechanisms

Expert highlights

The NAP does not have performance indicators and targets to track annual progress. The C-TIP stakeholders responsible for the implementation of these activities had a dichotomous approach to reporting progress (i.e., done or not done). The 2020–2022 NAP does not have a results framework thus the indicators and expected outcomes were not aligned to the specific planned activity. As a result, the NAP implementation monitoring is difficult to assess the correct progress when using indicators that are not specific and cannot be measured.

Based on this, it would be helpful for MOLSA and the C-TIP actors to clearly define the performance indicators for each activity and sub-activity geared towards improving the legislative reforms for counter-trafficking in and exploitation of persons in Armenia.

Recommendations

- I. Develop a clear legislative reform strategy to identify all the authorizing norms needed for a concerted multisectoral approach to combatting trafficking in persons (engage all C-TIP stakeholders). Also ensure participation of all implementing partners when developing authorizing norms.
- II. Introduce the definition of "forced labor" in the Labor Code and develop the required authorizing norms to operationalize the identification of forced labor cases. The Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MFA) to submit the package to the National Assembly.
- III. Conduct skills building on early identification of cases of forced labor for the Health and Labor Inspection Body (HLIB), case managers of Unified Social Services, community social workers.
- IV. Introduce bylaws that will authorize law enforcement agencies to share information with the MOLSA Division of Counter -Trafficking and Women's Issues on trafficking cases, thus making the referral mechanism more effective and victim-centered based on the recent amendments of the main Law.

¹⁰ Law on the Identification and Support of Persons Subjected to Trafficking and Exploitation

Chapter II. Prevention of trafficking in and exploitation of persons

The activities in this chapter are prevention-oriented and contribute to improving processes of identification and support to victims of trafficking and exploitation. They aim to raise public awareness of the threats of trafficking and exploitation of a person, increase staff capacities working in the state and non-state bodies (at national, regional, and local levels), agencies and institutions that work with the public in combating trafficking and exploitation, and increase media coverage in the prevention of trafficking in and exploitation of persons.

In total there were thirteen activities to be implemented in the three years and only one was to be completed in the first year (FY 2020). The NAP progress review established that in 2021, the actors¹¹ responsible made commendable progress and the rate of implementation was 75 percent with objective 1 of raising public awareness scoring very highly at 92 percent followed by objective two at 64 percent, and finally objective three performing at 83 percent.





Objective 1: Raising public awareness about trafficking and exploitation of persons

C.2.1.1: Raise awareness among young people about trafficking and exploitation of persons.

• The MOESYS conducted an event for 200 regional youth on human trafficking and its prevention. The forums were designed in two phases: an online sensitization for the participants and upon merit, select youth for the second phase of the event. The youth were sensitized to the problems of trafficking, its prevention, and coverage *through* the exercise.

C2.1.2: Prepare and disseminate among the population, especially potential labor migrants, information materials explaining the threats of trafficking in and exploitation of persons.

• Awareness raising among the general population was achieved through radio and other modes of information, education, and communication dissemination. Within the framework of Public Radio's "Your Voice" program, 4 programs were broadcasted, and 200 posters were

¹¹ Chapter II Actors: (1) RoA Ministry of Education, Science, Culture, and Sports; (2) Health and Labor Inspection body; (3) RoA Ministry of Foreign Affairs; (4) RoA Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs, (5) RoA Police, (6) RoA Investigative Committee (subject to consent), (7) RoA office of the Prosecution General (subject to consent); (8) RoA Ministry of Justice

published and distributed to 49 regional centers of the Unified Social Services on the topic of prevention of human trafficking and assistance to trafficked victims.

C2.2.3: Public awareness to respond to fake offers of work via the Internet and the social media, ensure safe migration, and reduce the risk of trafficking.

• Public awareness-raising on human trafficking and labor exploitation activities also occurred through social media and other online platforms. The Division for Combating Human Trafficking of the RoA police regularly conducted spot checks in the "AM" Armenian-language domains of the internet, popular websites, social networks, and Armenian blogs to identify and respond to online information with illegal content. The spot checks provide an opportunity to identify allegations of labor and sexual exploitation, illegal migration, and trafficking in human organs. They detect site users, organizations with questionable job offers, possible criminal intentions of employers, and more. The RoA police operate a 24-hour hotline to receive calls on human trafficking and exploitation. These activities are geared toward safe labor migration and reducing the risk of trafficking.

Objective 2: Awareness-raising and training on trafficking and exploitation of persons for the employees of state and regional government and local self-government bodies, as well as for employees of institutions and organizations that work directly with the public.

C2.2.1: Update the handbooks on trafficking and exploitation for employees of the Foreign Affairs Ministry system, the Defense Ministry system, and social sector specialists in line with the current legislation and situation

• The Ministry of Defense reviewed and included modules for its employees on trafficking and forced labor in the handbook on trafficking and exploitation within the human rights curricula taught in RoA military educational institutions.

C2:2:2: Capacity building of the staff of migration centers operating in Yerevan and in eight regions of the country (Aragatsotn, Tavush, Ararat, Armavir, Vayotz Dzor, Syunik, Lori, and Shirak); present the latest policies and current situation in the sector.

• Not done/implemented in the reporting period

C2:2:3: As part of the training of diplomats held in the Diplomatic School of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, in the course on Consular Activities, organize lectures on trafficking and exploitation.

• The Ministry of Foreign Affairs organized one lecture for diplomats on the fight against trafficking.

C2.2.4: Raise the awareness of professionals working in the Defense Ministry system and other missions with respect to addressing the risks of trafficking and exploitation during armed conflicts, fighting them, and using the existing mechanisms.

C2.2.5: Organize regular training courses for specialists of state government and local selfgovernment bodies and other bodies and organizations that have primary contacts with vulnerable groups.

• Sensitization courses on human trafficking and exploitation were conducted for staff that interact with vulnerable groups working in the Ministry of Defense, the police, and the State Migration Service. Two National Security Service (NSS) staff were trained on Human Trafficking through

courses organized by the Council of Europe Expert Group on Trafficking in Human Beings (GRETA) and the International Law Enforcement Academy (ILEA) in Budapest. The capacity strengthening is a part of efforts to help government staff identify and address risks associated with trafficking and exploitation during their duty execution, during armed conflict, and in other emergencies such as COVID-19.

C.2.2.6: Organize training courses and discussions for the staff of non-public organizations (especially tour operators, hotel entities, and tourist transportation companies) on the threats of trafficking in persons, especially children, as well as exploitation and forced labor.

• Not done/implemented in the reporting period.

C2.2.7: Organize training courses on trafficking in persons, labor exploitation, including trafficking in and exploitation of children, the peculiarities of forced labor, and the amendments made in the legislation, for employees of the following bodies and organizations related to the sector

- MOLSA, in collaboration with UMCOR, conducted training on provisions aimed at the prevention of trafficking and exploitation for staff of childcare institutions, social workers of the Unified Social Services, children ages 14–18 and their parents, and primary care workers of all regions in the RoA. The totals of those trained within this exercise were 105 social workers and 85 children and their parents.
- By the order of the head of the HLIB, the 2020–2022 plan in the fields of healthcare, health protection, and safety based on the C-TIP NAP was approved. The list of subdivisions responsible for the implementation of the activities and the schedule of actions was drawn up accordingly. HLIB staff were informed about the changes made in the legislation related to the field, as well as ensuring the labor rights of the child. Within the framework of the memorandum of cooperation signed between the Armenian branch of the World Vision and HLIB, a guidebook on "Compulsory or forced labor indicators in the Republic of Armenia" was introduced in the Inspection Body.

Objective 3: Increase the role of mass media in the prevention of trafficking and exploitation of persons

C2.3.1: Organize television and radio programs and discussions, including public service announcements to disseminate information on the threats and new forms of trafficking in and exploitation of persons.

• RoA police broadcast a video on trafficking on mass media channels (e.g., TV, RoA police website), highlighting the threats and new forms of trafficking and exploitation of persons.

C2.3.2: Organize television and radio programs and discussions, including public service announcements to disseminate information on the threats and new forms of trafficking in and exploitation of persons.

• The Association of Audio-Visual Reporters (AAVR) is instrumental in providing up-to-date media/online coverage on C-TIP and exploitation. As reported by the MESYS, with support from AAVR, four videos were produced on preventing irregular migration. They were aired and posted on the www.antitrafficking.am website. The regularly updated information, social media, and targeted promotions have made the site an effective platform for raising public awareness, especially among youth. During the reporting period, a total of 85 articles were

posted on the website, of which 54 were new articles in the Armenian language section of the website and 31 were new articles in the English language section. The materials are grouped into three types: news, publications in the international media, and publications in the Armenian media. The activity is carried out with financial support provided by the state as regulated by agreement No. 2 of June 25, 2021.

C2.3.4: Ensure the operation of the www.antitrafficking.am website, which is dedicated to the fight against trafficking in and exploitation of persons in the Republic of Armenia.

• An annual competition for journalists who have covered trafficking-related issues in their publications was conducted for two categories: TV/radio materials and print/electronic materials. Unfortunately, there were no applicants in 2021 for the first category due to a lack of the authorizing norms to cover human trafficking and exploitation. Thus, no work on TV/radio on C-TIP is underway that would qualify a journalist for the nomination.

Gaps identified

- Inadequate funds are allocated to some state agencies (MFA, social sectors) to implement the planned activities such as a review of the handbooks on trafficking and labor exploitation.
- No government agency hosts data and information on counter-trafficking and exploitation of persons in the RoA. AAVR by default runs the C-TIP-related posts and awareness creation campaigns.
- Counter -trafficking advocacy and information sharing lacks coordination mechanisms. The current, limited coordination structure hinders effective operationalization of the C-TIP intervention/responses.

Expert highlights

Since early 2000, the Armenian counter-trafficking community has been actively involved in raising awareness on human trafficking issues. Activities aimed at informing the public at large about the crime of trafficking make an essential part of all the NAPs developed by the national C-TIP actors. However, most of the activities were aimed at preventing the consequences of trafficking rather than looking into the root causes to combat the crime. The same approach is replicated in the current C-TIP national action plan. There is a lack of evidence-based approaches that target population subgroups who might be more vulnerable to trafficking.

There is a greater call to use evidence to jointly formulate multisectoral strategies amongst national actors working poverty reduction, migration management, youth empowerment, and child protection sectors. There is a greater need to define a performance management framework that encompasses qualitative and quantitative measures for prevention related activities, a step towards routine monitoring of C-TIP implementation performance as per the NAP.

Greater efforts should be put into defining the most vulnerable groups: youth, people with disabilities, women, people who are unemployed, etc. Besides awareness-raising, information dissemination, or training activities, C-TIP prevention activities should include structural adjustments in the communities to reduce vulnerabilities. Prevention measures could include poverty reduction, protection of women's and migrant's rights activities, etc. The recommendations developed based on this expert assessment prioritize the development of an effective prevention chain.

Recommendations

- I. Conduct research to identify hotspots for trafficking in persons and the vulnerable groups in the society (youth, disabled, women, unemployed, people with mental health issues).
- II. Advocate among the national stakeholders to design poverty reduction, social protection, migration management, youth empowerment, child protection and public safety and security interventions with a C-TIP lens.
- III. Enhance interagency partnerships to undertake collaborative activities such as review and dissemination of child labor indicators, handbooks for frontline social workers, develop information products on human trafficking and labor exploitation to increase awareness among the public, state, and non- state employees at all levels.
- IV. Analyze and create profiles for trafficked victims and perpetrators for C-TIP actors to develop targeted prevention strategies.
- V. Institutionalize training on trafficking and exploitation in the training program of the consular staff of the MFA Diplomatic Academy and include a C-TIP module.
- VI. Institutionalize regular Inter-Ministerial Council meetings.
- VII. Revise reporting period to quarterly and semi-annual reports from ministries and other members of the Inter-ministerial Council on progress, challenges of implementing C-TIP activities.

Chapter III. Prevention of trafficking in and exploitation of children

The activities in this chapter are prevention-oriented and contribute towards improving processes of identification and support to victims of trafficking and exploitation. They aim to equip the targeted audience with the necessary knowledge on risks of trafficking and exploitation; reveal and analyze the situation of vulnerable children dropping out of mandatory education and at risk of trafficking; raise caregivers' awareness about legislation related to working children and prevention of child labor and improve interviewing procedures used with child witnesses/victims of trafficking in criminal proceedings.

In total there were five activities to be implemented in the three-year NAP period and two were to start in Year 3 (FY 2022). The NAP progress review established that in 2021; the actors responsible made commendable progress as follows:

C3.1.1: In general schools and in primary (crafts) and secondary vocational education institutions, conduct human rights training (also covering topics of trafficking and exploitation) for the students and the teachers.

- The Ministry of Education, Science, Culture, and Sports (MoESCS) has ensured that the students at secondary and primary schools are taught topics related to human rights, including trafficking and exploitation. In the year 2021, the reach was to a total of 1500 schools—both primary and secondary. In particular:
 - In the 12th grade, the philosophy component of the social science unit includes "Exploitation of human beings (trafficking) as a negative phenomenon of modern global society" (an 8-hour course). The world history section includes "The World in Modern Times" (an 11-hour course), which addresses the topic "Fight against international terrorism, drug addiction and trafficking."

- "Corruption and trafficking" are included in the authorities' section of the 8th grade social science unit.
- The directors of the RoA's vocational and secondary professional educational institutions have been instructed to organize courses on human rights, including trafficking and exploitation, within the framework of the "Fundamentals of Law" module.

C3.1.3: Organize seminars and discussions to raise awareness of the safeguards provided in the Armenian legislation for working children and to prevent the involvement of working children in the worst forms of labor.

- During the reporting period, the HLIB and UMCOR conducted awareness-raising activities in 150 communities of Ararat and Armavir provinces on the specifics of involving minors under the age of 18 in work. The information on the legislative requirements concerning hiring persons under 18 was sent to the heads of these communities.
- The HLIB has developed a list that includes the number of children working, and types of work/sectors. To collect, analyze, and assess statistical data on child labor and inform the response, HLIB has developed a checklist to be used by its inspectors. This collects data on the number of employees under the age of 18, cases of child labor, and involvement of minors in harmful types of work. The checklist was adopted by the Government on April 30, 2020 (Decision No. 718-N). HLIB revises and updates risk-determining criteria according to inspection risk factors (sectors involved, gender, and age -Decree No.1124-N, dated August 22, 2019). The HLIB gets information from the State Revenue Committee (SRC) about the employees under 18 working in various sectors in the RoA. As reported by the HLIB, the SRC provides not numbers, but the ratio of working minors to the total number of employees in Armenia. Thus, as reported by the SRC, as of 2021, male/female employees under 18 make up not more than 25% of the total number of employees.

C3.1.5: Study the peculiarities of interviewing child witnesses of victims of trafficking in criminal proceedings, and when necessary, make recommendations on improving the existing procedures.

- In 2021, UNICEF, together with RoA police, disseminated a guidebook on the psychological characteristics of minor witnesses/victims and the peculiarities of conducting interviews with them to the officers of specialized police units. The handbook provides guidance for interviewing children without incurring re-victimization.
- Progress in the Ministry of Justice, Prosecutor's Office, and Investigative Committee included:
 - Ensuring child-sensitive approaches and prioritizing to keep the best interests of the child protected during criminal proceedings, a draft package of proposals for amendments to the provisions of the Criminal Procedure Code on juvenile interrogation was drafted and included in the amendment of the legislation.
 - A draft decree of the Government of the RoA has been developed to define the qualification procedure for psychologists involved in the investigation with the participation of a minor, disabled person, or a person with mental health issues.
 - A training program for psychologists conducted for the investigation of cases of domestic violence, cases involving minors, disabled persons, or persons with mental

health issues was developed. Additionally, 25 psychologists participated in the three-week training and one-week internship at the RoA Investigative Committee and its branches.

Gaps identified

- Inadequate collaboration among MOLSA divisions for example between the Division of Counter -Trafficking and Women's Issues and the Division of Child Affairs to track and consolidate data on children dropping out of mandatory education (delinquents).
- Inadequate skills among actors (the police, other law enforcement agencies, and NGOs) in the detection and prevention of child trafficking and labor exploitation activities in the RoA.

Expert highlights

Chapter 3 of the NAP targets children as being at high risk of trafficking. Inclusion of this chapter in the NAP proves that the GoA prioritizes the prevention of trafficking among children. The Division of Children's Services in MOLSA has not outlined standards for data collection and analysis related to trafficking among children, or established strategies for data use. Assessing the impact of the outlined strategies and activities was a weak area during the formulation of the NAP activities and thus it is not conducted as part of routine monitoring and evaluation.

Introducing standard indicators and other follow-up would help track improvements in C-TIP knowledge and skills. Criteria are also needed for selecting teachers to conduct courses on this sensitive issue. In some child case studies within this assessment, the question of identification and when to define a case as trafficking and refer to relevant authorities remains a significant challenge. This problem has become apparent among the staff of various childcare agencies, particularly daycare centers, thus reducing the chances for proactive intervention. This is especially problematic in rural areas, where child labor is often used in agriculture, construction, and other fields and is considered acceptable in the socio-cultural context. The activities in this chapter call for integrated use of data on children in the workforce, perceptions of exploitation, contributing socio-cultural factors, and progress made in addressing labor issues among children.

Recommendations

- I. Conduct advocacy campaigns/public events on child exploitation targeting socio-cultural context and environment.
- II. Target places of work where children are likely to be employed such as agriculture, construction, and other fields. Based on that enhance joint activities of supervisions and awareness raising among private sector and businesses in those fields.
- III. Develop activities such as games on counter-trafficking for use among the school-aged children.
- IV. Identify and conduct proactive prevention activities and inter agency activities all child protection bodies, day care centers.
- V. Develop and adopt child-friendly and child-centered procedures in investigation, prosecution, and improve access to support services.
- VI. Ensure more active cooperation (at as early stages as possible) of childcare institutions, psychologists, and social workers with law enforcement agencies when dealing with cases of child trafficking.
- VII. Develop guidelines of how to identify child labor and the methodology to be used (SOP of identification of child labor/checklist).

VIII. Develop guidelines for teachers, college staff, out-of-school educational institutions and train the respective personnel to detect and prevent child labor and child any trafficking.

Chapter IV. Detection, protection, and support of persons subjected to trafficking and exploitation

The activities in this chapter are geared towards improving processes of identification of and support to victims of trafficking and exploitation. They aim to operationalize the social-psychological rehabilitation programs for people trafficked, exploited, and sexually abused. Of the two activities to be implemented in the 3 years, one was to start implementation in year 3 (FY2022). The NAP progress review established that in the year 2021, the relevant national actors, including MOLSA, made commendable progress to *implement the measures provided by the Program for Social-Psychological Rehabilitation of Persons Subjected to Trafficking and Exploitation and Victims of Sexual Violence*.

Through increased advocacy, the state budget allocation doubled in the year 2020 and 2021 to AMD 40 million compared to the 2019 allocation of AMD 19 million. Under this program, the assistance provided includes accommodation, in-kind assistance, provision, or restoration of necessary documents, medical care and service, legal, psychological, and advisory assistance, dedicated care in the relevant institution, provision of translation services, provision of basic education and other services as provided by law.

In 2021, 31 victims of trafficking were identified, but only three were referred to the specialized NGO to get the necessary support. At the partner organization, 202 calls were received by the dedicated hotline services. In the reporting year 2021, the Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs did not refer victims of trafficking to health care institutions to get state-guaranteed free medical care and services.

Gaps identified

- Lack of toolkit and capacity of identifying forced labor (a legislative and identification issue)
- Inadequate victim-sensitive approaches would allow victims to easily apply for support services
- Inadequate capacity among some state agencies, e.g., the police in remote regions of the country, and social workers, to detect trafficking and exploitation cases and to provide protection and referral for support services
- Lack of institutionalized coordination and collaboration among the stakeholders (state and nonstate agencies) of the Identification Commission

Expert highlights

The activities of this chapter are only partially aligned with the title and purpose of the chapter. In particular, the title of the chapter emphasizes three main areas: detection, protection, and support. However, none of the activities listed address detection or protection. Moreover, only one of the two activities is planned for the duration of the NAP, including the reporting period (2021). The second activity will be carried out in the third quarter of 2022.

Therefore, the performance score obtained in this assessment conducted by the NAP actors is a result of the incomplete actions defined in Chapter 4, as well as the perception by the national C-TIP actors that the only activity planned for the 2021 reporting period is implemented/completed. In essence, the "detection" component of this chapter, which logically anticipates law enforcement proactive involvement, is not included in the chapter; there is no law enforcement body responsible

for any action in this section. This is a significant gap in the development and implementation of, as well as reporting on the NAP.

The regulation on defining and ensuring protection measures for victims of trafficking, approved by Government's decree 1356-N, 29 Oct 201512, is not reported in any activity of this chapter, and it is crucial to have data on the number of cases when protection was provided by law enforcement, types of protection, the proportion of actual and presumed victims who apply for protection services, etc. The list of agencies responsible for achieving the objectives of this chapter of the NAP is incomplete, so the structures missing on the list have no obligation to participate actively and to be accountable. The support component of the chapter has so far worked only for those who have applied for the assistance program. The assessment shows that, for a variety of reasons, victims were unwilling or unable to benefit from assistance programs. This limited access and uptake significantly reduces the effectiveness of the support measures.

Of the 31 victims identified during the reporting period (2021), only 3 applied for services, which is unlikely to reflect the number of people who needed professional assistance/reintegration. The 31 victims were 6 males and 25 were female composed of 8 children (under 18 years) and 23 adults. 18 years and above). No information exists on the remaining victims who did not receive the services intended for this target group due to the inaccessibility of direct contact with the assisting specialists/structures providing support services. There is no clear distinction between support and protection activities, their performance indicators are not clearly defined to be used for monitoring purposes.

In this chapter, it is important to clarify activities aimed at identifying victims in need of protection and making services available to them. Another noteworthy issue is the collection of quantitative and qualitative data on the quality of services, analysis, and substantiation of the necessary funding proposal. Improving victim identification and self-identification mechanisms is not reflected in this chapter, which would help to get a more realistic picture of trafficking in the country, organize improved support services for victims, and prevent re-victimization. Based on the above, it becomes clear that the expert assessment differs from the 100% score self-assessment given by the NAP national actors in Figure 2.

Recommendations

- I. Each agency defines the set of detection and protection activities to be undertaken (using the appropriate legislation on protective measures) and put in place a mechanism for monitoring and accounting for the detection actions.
- II. Improve the access of victims and presumed victims to benefit from assistance programs during the investigation and judicial trial. Establish a system of support services offered, where the assistance is managed by specialists of different agencies including NGOs.
- III. Review the monitoring and accountability of assistance programs, such as include qualitative indicators, re-entry and re integration programs for victims during the investigation, trial, and after trial.
- IV. Establish and scale up a sustainable capacity building activities for agencies undertaking protection and support of trafficked persons (that includes a curriculum development)

¹² https://www.arlis.am/documentview.aspx?docID=101957

- V. Scale up joint skill-building activities for police and social workers in remote regions of Armenia to strengthen their response in detection and protection of victims trafficking and exploitation.
- VI. Review the roles, responsibilities, and operational procedures of the members of the Identification Commission for an enhanced support of/interaction with the presumed victims of trafficking. A recommendation to ensure the specialized NGOs' direct contact with the presumed victims to fast-track needs identification and requisite services to be provided for each specific case.
- VII. Develop a structured reporting mechanism for the three platforms governing C-TIP: Identification Commission, C-TIP Working Group, and C-TIP Inter-Ministerial Council.

Chapter V. International cooperation

The activities under this chapter were geared towards enhancing cooperation among the actors combating trafficking in persons. The NAP progress review established that in 2021, the national actors made commendable progress in strengthening cooperation internationally, regionally, and with the respective specialized NGOs and international organizations operating in the country, as well as diplomatic missions accredited in the Republic of Armenia. The implementation rate for all the planned activities in 2021 was 88 percent.

C.5.1.1: Ensure the continuity of cooperation with international, regional, and nongovernmental organizations specialized in combatting trafficking in and exploitation of persons, as well as with the representatives of diplomatic missions accredited in the Republic of Armenia.

Ongoing cooperation with international, regional, and non-governmental organizations

- In 2021, the Office of the High Commissioner for Diaspora Affairs signed a memorandum with the Armenian Bar Association operating in Russia. Ongoing interaction occurs between the High Commissioner for Diaspora Affairs and the President of the Bar Association.
- Two RA police officers attended the Black Sea Economic Cooperation Working Group Forum on Fight against Crime on December 7, 2021. During the forum, issues on cooperation and progress in the fight against human trafficking, drug trafficking, and cybercrime were raised and discussed.
- On November 11, 2021, a meeting with the representatives of the International Organization for Migration was held at the Central Bureau of Interpol in Armenia on "Irregular migration, human trafficking, residence status of foreigners in Armenia and issues related to granting this status."
- On September 16, 2021, Europol and Armenia signed a Strategic Partnership Agreement to expand cooperation in the fight against cross-border crime. The agreement will enable the two partners to work in key areas such as migrant smuggling, cybercrime, drug trafficking, asset recovery, money laundering, organized crime, and human trafficking. Relevant studies have been conducted to improve the effectiveness of the fight against human trafficking and exploitation, as well as the cooperation between the RoA police, specialized international, regional, non-governmental organizations, other relevant RoA bodies, and law enforcement agencies of Interpol member countries.

- HLIB participated in the launch of the "Awareness on and Prevention of Human Trafficking, Exploitation," an information campaign on August 2, 2021. From September 6–10, they participated in the third phase of the evaluation of GRETA (Council of Europe Group of Experts on Trafficking in Human Beings) on Armenia, during which the parties referred to Armenia's commitments under the Convention against Trafficking in Human Beings, the implementation process in the period 2016–2021, the existing challenges, and possible solutions.
- The Ministry of Foreign Affairs supported the participation of the RA state agencies and NGOs in the conference held on October 13–14, 2021, at the Vienna School of International Studies on the EU Anti-Trafficking Day.
- Representatives of the MOH regularly participated in events organized by international, regional, and non-governmental organizations specializing in the field of trafficking in human beings, as well as provided reports on the work done in the area to international organizations through the Ministry of Foreign Affairs.
- Cooperation with international organizations, non-governmental organizations (NGOs)
 - Cooperation with the Office of the President of the UN General Assembly in the evaluation of the UN Global Action Plan against Trafficking in Human Beings in preparation for the 2021 Summit. A questionnaire provided by the OSCE Special Representative for Combatting Human Trafficking Valiant Richey was completed and submitted to the OSCE.
 - The Permanent Mission of the Republic of Armenia to the UN (Vienna) joined the two resolutions on trafficking submitted by Belarus, Italy, and the United States at the 30th session of the UN Commission on Crime Prevention in Vienna in May 2021.
 - During the 47th session of the UN Human Rights Council on June 29–July 1, 2021, a dialogue took place between the Permanent Mission of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Armenia and the UN Special Representative for Trafficking in Human Beings, especially Women and Children.
 - A memorandum on cooperation was signed between World Vision-Armenia and the HLIB. It aims to strengthen the professional capacity of HLIB employees in detecting and assessing alleged cases of forced or compulsory labor and introduce institutional mechanisms.
 - Cooperation continues with NGOs within the implementation of 2020–2022 NAP activities to combat human trafficking and exploitation. Key NGOs in the area are Hope and Help NGO, Democracy Today NGO, and UMCOR Armenia.
- Capacity building
 - Some forums were geared towards increasing the C-TIP actors' skills in combating trafficking and exploitation of persons. During the reporting period, two officers from the Prosecutor's Office participated in a training organized by Budapest International Law Enforcement Academy on the "Fight against Trafficking" from June 29–July 1, 2021.

C.5.1.2: Strengthen cooperation with foreign law enforcement authorities in combatting trafficking and exploitation of persons.

- Within the framework of the fight against human trafficking and exploitation through Interpol and other foreign law enforcement agencies, the document circulation of the Interpol National Central Bureau (NCB) in Armenia amounted to 342 information pieces. In this, the NCB closely collaborates with the RoA NSS, investigative bodies, and RoA police subdivisions, sharing information, and methodological materials. There is direct information exchange on specific cases within the framework of inquiries received from individuals.
- The NCB regularly examines the lists of persons wanted under Articles 132, 132 prim, 261, and 262 of the RoA Criminal Code to discuss the expediency of declaring the results related to internationally wanted individuals. Using the data obtained from measures taken to find internationally wanted persons, in cooperation with the Vagharshapat Department of the RoA police in 2021, one person internationally wanted by the Moldovan law enforcement agencies for organizing illegal migration was found by Russian LE structures in the RoA.
- The RoA police also participate in the implementation of joint operative-investigative measures within the framework of cooperation with the CIS member states. Within the 2019–2023 Interstate Program of Joint Measures for Combating Crime" and according to the 2019–2023 Comprehensive Joint Operative-Preventive Measures Plan-Schedule for 2021, events were organized in the territory of the Republic of Armenia by the territorial subdivisions of the General Directorate of the RoA police. Issues on preventing and detecting crimes related to all aspects of human trafficking were covered. The results of the measures taken were summarized and sent to the CIS Coordination Bureau for Organized Crime and Other Dangerous Types of Crimes.
- Materials received from the Coordination Council of the General Prosecutors of the CIS Member States: Guidebook on identified cases of trafficking in Russia and Uzbekistan.

Gaps identified

• Legal cooperation with the countries with a high risk of trafficking is not smoothly implemented (Turkey, UAE).

Expert highlights

International organizations conducting C-TIP projects provide active, targeted assistance to national stakeholders. This collaborative reality is poorly reflected in Chapter 5 of the current NAP. According to the expert opinion, the results expected to come from strengthening law enforcement agencies' cooperation with international organizations are not specified.

The formulation of activities is highly declarative, for example, "to ensure continuity/implementation, to strengthen the cooperation," etc. These need to be measurable to help in the process of monitoring the effectiveness of their implementation. This observation can be extended to almost all chapters and activities of the NAP. The reporting period is also blurred, covering the entire period of the NAP implementation.

Recommendations

- I. Develop tools of cooperation within the international treaties that will allow information sharing, even in cases when there are no diplomatic relations.
- II. Formulate the target goal and the intended outcomes of international cooperation and define activities so progress is measurable.

Chapter VI. Surveys, monitoring, and evaluation

The activities under this chapter were geared towards providing data/information on trafficked or exploited persons, the perpetrators, forms of exploitation, places of origin, target countries, and other data.

The NAP progress review established that in 2021, the RoA police, the RoA Investigative Committee, the prosecutor's office, the statistical committee, and MOLSA attained an implementation rate of 88 percent for the year under review.

C.6.1.1: Provide information to the Trafficking and Exploitation Victims Identification Commission on the outcome of criminal cases initiated in connection with crimes of trafficking in and exploitation of persons.

- The RoA police provided information on victims of trafficking regularly to the Identification Commission.
- The RoA Prosecutor's Office submitted data on annual basis to the Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs. In addition, the representative of the Prosecutor's Office is a member of the Identification Commission and regularly provides relevant data on the number and status of criminal cases during the meetings that are chaired by MOLSA.
- The statistical Committee receives data collected by respective agencies as approved by the decisions of the State Council of Statistics and collates it into statistical reports. The data collection tools are special forms/templates used by national agencies, including:
 - The General Prosecutor's Office submits semi-annual statistical reports to the statistical committee on the investigative work conducted by investigative agencies
 - RoA police submits on a semi-annual basis their statistical report on the discussion of the statements of crimes submitted by the investigative bodies

C.6.2.1: Clarify the profile of persons subjected to trafficking in and exploitation of persons, as well as the perpetrators of these crimes, as per data collected about them and analyzed (age and sex breakdown, status, social status, form of exploitation, place (origin/target country), and other data).

• The Division of Counter- Trafficking and Women's Issues does not have a uniform way of collecting data from all agencies and actors who conduct C-TIP activities. In 2021, the Investigative Committee reported 16 initiated criminal cases, of which seven were categorized as labor exploitation and nine were sex trafficking cases. While in the same year, MOLSA reported on 31 identified victims, of which 6 were male and 25 were female. The victims were of various age groups ranging from 18–65. Overall, there were 24 victims of sexual trafficking and 7 were associated with labor exploitation. The cases were spread across different age groups with the majority ages 18–30 (10) and 31–45 (10); while three victims were ages 46–65, and the remaining 8 were under 18. They were all Armenians from various locations/administrative units as per Table 2.

Table 2: 2021 Identified victims by origin

Region	No.	Region	No.
Yerevan	14	Syunik	2
Lori	5	Gegharquniq	1
Lotayk	3	Ararat	1
Armavir	2	Shirak	1
Vayots Dzor	2	Total	31

Table 3: Existing Data Collection Systems related to TIP

Institutions	Data collection methods and databases used	C-TIP indicators	Frequency of data collection
MOLSA, Division of Child Issues, NORK Information System	"MANUK" Information System database, "Nork" Information Center	Number of child exploitation cases, including child labor and, sexual exploitation, Other, Number of trafficked victims	Not applied
MOLSA, Unified Social Service, NORK Information System	Social case Management Information System, "Nork" Information Center	Risk of trafficking: Yes or No	Not applied
MOLSA, Division of Women and Trafficking Issues	Administrative data reported by Identification Commission MS office tools (Word, Excel)	Number of victims segregated by sex, age, citizenship, place; type of trafficking/exploitation; the agency that has revealed the case, and the number of victims referred for social assistance	Quarterly
Investigative Committee of the RoA, Department for a fight against human trafficking and illicit circulation of drugs	Administrative data on offenses MS office tools	Number of criminal cases: Criminal Code article Victims' numbers are segregated by sex, age, Place of trafficking (Country); Type of trafficking	Semester, annually
Prosecutor's office of the RoA	Administrative data on offenses MS office tools	Number of criminal cases, number of court verdicts, number of convicted persons, segregated by sex, age, trafficking type	Semester, annually
Police of the Republic of Armenia (RoA)	MS Office tools (Word, Excel)	Number of prepared preliminary cases segregated by criminal article, type of trafficking; Victims' data segregated by sex, age, and country of the case	Semester, annually
Gaps identified

- Lack of a standardized reporting mechanism including data collection and management tools for screening, referral, etc., and management information system) that can be used by respective actors according to their mandate to improve policy development and targeted implementation. There is a disconnect between the number of victims reported by the Identification Commission (spearheaded by MOLSA) and the number of cases at the Investigative Commission.
- The NAP as developed does not define the performance indicators, targets, and data source for the activities thus unable to objective track implementation progress
- Inadequate expertise within MOLSA to undertake the monitoring and evaluation of the counter-trafficking activities.
- There is an inadequate capacity to define the key performance indicators during the development of the National Plan of Action (NAP) and the lack of a framework to systematically track the progress of all the counter-trafficking responses/interventions in the country.
- The current reporting period is semi-annual, thus real-time data for C-TIP programming is not available when conducting review meetings.
- Unclear data reporting lines for consolidated C-TIP data. The investigative bodies that do not have such an obligation under the law are not authorized and do not have such authority to provide information to the Identification Commission.
- MOLSA has databases in place or under development (MANUK) but are not interoperable and there is minimal data sharing.

Expert Highlights

National actors have prioritized research around trafficking and initiating monitoring and evaluation of the C-TIP NAP implementation. This is evidenced by having a separate chapter on this topic in the current NAP. However, the analytical approach shows that the activities envisaged in this chapter lack a common logic, a clear identification of actors, and steps to be taken for establishing a unified chain of data production, data collection, exchange, and data use. So far, national state actors have not conducted any study on the issue of human trafficking, or analysis of trafficking-related statistical data in combination with other sectorial data.

While the importance of monitoring is emphasized in the NAP, it is limited to the submission of semi-annual and annual reports. This deserves more consideration as there is no analysis of the submitted reports, and therefore limited use of these results. The analysis of the impact of counter-trafficking trends and activities of the NAP should be given more attention by the Inter-Ministerial Council and the WG.

Studies conducted by international organizations and national NGOs, and analysis of the C-TIP statistical data, will be of great help in reviewing the current strategies used in C-TIP programming.

Activity 6.1.2 of the current NAP on developing profiles of the victims of trafficking and organizers is unrealistic due to the incompleteness of the relevant data system, which is often contradictory if we compare data collected by different agencies.

• Only in the case of aggregation/processing of large amounts of data is it possible to create offender and/or victim profiles that will contribute to the development of more realistic, well-

grounded counter-trafficking approaches in both sectors (law enforcement and social protection). It is therefore a priority to develop a unified database, which will include separate sections for data collected on both victims and traffickers over several years.

• There is no M&E Plan for MOLSA to follow and implement, including for its C-TIP strategy and activities. C-TIP activities are reported to MOLSA by each agency through the forms and reporting mechanisms that do not always use clear indicators and interrelated data. There is no clear connection and reflection between the strategic planning, NAP, and the data framework. The regulations of the respective department/division in MOLSA have a general description of the data collection and monitoring function with no clear provision of standard operating procedure on how it should be done. So far there has not been any technical assistance in the field that would promote M&E activities; D4I is the first project addressing this issue.

Recommendations

- Define a M&E system with performance indicators & outcomes to be used for regular tracking of the counter-trafficking in persons and exploitation of persons NAP
 - Map data variables and procedures between social protection and prosecution agencies
 - Develop and review data collection tools (manual or electronic) for use by the C-TIP actors and agencies as per the monitoring indicators
 - Explore modalities of strengthening the data collection and management tools (paper and digital) of C-TIP data Explore across all agencies both state and non-state
- Develop a set of variables for integration into existing data collection tools and Information Systems, particularly in Social Needs Assessment Questionnaire for Children in Adversity, family need assessment questionnaires for case managers in Unified Social Services and Assessment tools of Community Social Workers, Employment Service Employees, etc. There is a call to have interoperable databases for on children in adversity (MANUK or other) and children vulnerable to trafficking and trafficked victims to monitor progress of the interventions.
- Analyze the need for the development of an interoperable human trafficking data collection platform, in which different systems can communicate and share relevant information.
- Review the reporting period for timely submission of C-TIP data. A recommendation to institute a quarterly reporting when agencies need to share their data with MOLSA by seventh day of the month after each quarter.
- Identify and prioritize capacity-strengthening activities for MOLSA and other actors on C-TIP data management and detail them in an M&E capacity-strengthening plan for the division.
- Strengthen the M&E role in C-TIP NAP planning and implementation.
- Conduct evaluation on the C-TIP cases and their outcomes for initiating required steps by relevant national agencies.

Conclusions and Recommendations

Recommendations

The assessment of the NAP implementation reveals areas where new knowledge and capacity would support the development of the next NAP with a more targeted approach, measurable activities, clear outcomes, and mechanisms for accountability.

Key recommendations for NAP planning and implementation are as follows:

- I. Use the theory of change for developing the next NAP: decide what needs to change, how to accomplish it, and which activities will lead to the expected results.
- II. Use existing trafficking-related data in interconnected fields, studies, and research papers for each activity to have clear targeted group/s to design activities for (e.g., how many children in adversity are identified as vulnerable to trafficking, which communities are at the greatest risk [high unemployment, etc.])
- III. When developing the 2023–2025 NAP, **formulate measurable indicators** and realistic targets using baseline data, e.g., detection of trafficking cases is improved, and the number of revealed cases is increased by police officers due to attending training courses.
- IV. Institutionalize M&E in the Division of Counter- Trafficking and Women's Issues. During the development of the subsequent C-TIP NAPs, include a results framework and mechanisms for monitoring implementation. Each C-TIP objective should have clear activities, performance indicators, source of data, targets, and responsible actor to avoid duplication of effort among the stakeholders.
- V. Develop routine **data collection tools** and institutionalize a **management information system** with the Division of Counter- Trafficking and Women's Issues.
- VI. In the monitoring and evaluation of the C-TIP national action plan of the next NAP, reference the assessments and analytical reports by international experts and donors. Reports prepared by the Group of Experts on Action against Trafficking in Human Beings (GRETA) monitoring the implementation of the Council of Europe Convention and the U.S. State Department (annual Trafficking in Persons [TIP] report).
- VII. The next C-TIP NAP should be costed to track spending relative to funding sources and identify deficits in a timely fashion. Support from non-state actors should be included, as these actors implement C-TIP activities in the RoA.

Summary Recommendation

Table 4: Summary recommendations by chapter

Recommendations	Responsible Authority/Authorities	Timeline	
Chapter I. Improving the legislation to fight against trafficking in	and exploitation of perso	ons	
Develop a clear legislative reform strategy to identify the framework in place for concerted multisectoral approach to combatting trafficking in persons (engage all C-TIP actors).	MOLSA	Annually	
Introduce the definition of "forced labor" in the Labor Code and develop the required authorizing norms to operationalize the identification and proper intervention of forced labor cases.	MOLSA, HLIB	2022	
Conduct skills building on early identification of cases of forced labor for the Health and Labor Inspection Body (HLIB), case managers of Unified Social Services, community social workers.	MOLSA, HLIB, Ministry of Territorial Administration and Infrastructure	Annually	
Introduce bylaws that will authorize law enforcement agencies to share information with the MOLSA Division of Counter-Trafficking and Women's Issues on trafficking cases, thus making the referral mechanism more effective and victim centered, based on the recent amendments of the main law.	MOLSA, Investigative Committee of RA, Prosecutors office, Ministry of Justice	2023	
Chapter II. Prevention of trafficking in and exploitation of person	s	1	
Conduct research to identify hotspots for trafficking in persons and the vulnerable groups in the society (youth, disabled, women, unemployed, people with mental health issues).	MOLSA, Migration Service, Ministry of Education, Science, Culture and Sport, Municipality of Yerevan	2022–2023	
Advocate among the national stakeholders to design poverty reduction, social protection, migration management, youth empowerment, child protection and public safety, and security interventions with a lens of combating human trafficking and exploitation of persons.	MOLSA, Police of RA	Permanent	
Mainstream the issue of combating human trafficking and exploitation of persons when designing poverty reduction, social protection, migration management, youth empowerment, child protection and public safety, and security interventions.			

Recommendations	Responsible Authority/Authorities	Timeline	
Enhance inter agency partnerships to undertake collaborative activities such as review and dissemination of child labor indicators, handbooks for frontline social workers, develop information products on human trafficking and labor exploitation to increase awareness among the public, state, and non-state employees at all levels.	MOLSA, HLIB	Permanent	
Analyze and create profiles for trafficked victims and perpetrators for C-TIP actors to develop targeted prevention strategies.	MOLSA Prosecutor's office Investigative Committee	2022–2023	
Institutionalize training on trafficking and exploitation in the training program of the consular staff of the MFA Diplomatic Academy and include a C-TIP module.	MFA	2023	
Institutionalize regular Inter-Ministerial Council meetings, Revise reporting period to quarterly and semi-annual reports from the ministries and other members of the Inter-ministerial Council on progress, challenges of implementing C-TIP activities.	MOLSA, Working Group members, other Government Agencies	2022–2025	
Chapter III. Prevention of trafficking in and exploitation of childre	en		
Conduct advocacy campaigns/public events on child exploitation targeting socio-cultural context and environment.	MOLSA, Ministry of Territorial Administration and Infrastructure, Ministry of Education, Science, Culture and Sport	Every year	
Target places of work where children are likely to be employed such as agriculture, construction, and other fields. Enhance joint activities of supervisions and awareness raising among private sector and businesses in those fields.	Police of RA, HLIB,	Permanent	
Develop activities such as games on counter -trafficking for use among the school-aged children.	Ministry of Education, science, Culture and Sport	2023	
Identify and conduct proactive prevention activities and interagency activities in all child protection bodies and daycare centers.	MOLSA	Permanent	
Develop and adopt child-friendly and child-centered procedures in investigation, prosecution, and improve access to support services.	Ministry of Justice, Investigative Committee of RA	2023	

Recommendations	Responsible Authority/Authorities	Timeline	
Ensure institutionalized cooperation (as early as possible) of childcare institutions, psychologists, and social workers with law enforcement agencies when dealing with cases of child trafficking.	Police of RA, MOLSA, Investigative Committee of RA	Permanent	
Develop guidelines of how to identify child labor and the methodology to be used (SOP for identification of child labor/checklist).	HLIB	2022–2023	
Develop guidelines for teachers, college staff, out-of-school educational institutions and train the respective personnel to detect and prevent child labor and child any trafficking.	Ministry of Education, Science, Culture and Sport	2023	
Chapter IV. Detection, protection, and support of persons subject	cted to trafficking and exp	loitation	
Each agency should define the set of detection and protection activities to be undertaken (using the appropriate legislation on protective measures) and put in place a mechanism for monitoring and accounting for the detection actions.	Police of RA, Prosecutors Office of RA, Investigative Committee of RA, MOLSA, HLIB	2022–2023	
Improve the access of victims and presumed victims to benefit from assistance programs during the investigation and judicial trial. Establish a system of support services offered, where the assistance is managed by specialists of different agencies including NGOs.	MOLSA, Police of RA, Prosecutors Office, Judicial Department of RA, Investigative Committee of RA	2022	
Review the monitoring and accountability of assistance programs, such as include qualitative indicators, re-entry and re integration programs for victims during the investigation, trial, and post-trial.	MOLSA	2022–2024	
Establish and scale up a sustainable capacity building activities for agencies undertaking protection and support of trafficked persons (that includes a curriculum development).	Working Group Agencies and Authorities	2022–2024	
Scale up of joint skills building activities for police and social workers in remote regions of Armenia to strengthen their response in detection and protection of victims trafficking and exploitation.			
Review the roles, responsibilities, and operational procedures of the members of the Identification Commission for enhanced support of/interaction with presumed victims of trafficking. A recommendation to ensure the specialized NGOs' direct contact with the presumed victims to fast-track needs identification and requisite services to be provided for each specific case.	Identification Committee under MOLSA	2022–2024	

Recommendations	Responsible Authority/Authorities	Timeline	
Develop a structured reporting mechanism for the three platforms governing C-TIP: Identification Commission, C-TIP Working Group, and C-TIP Inter-Ministerial Council.	MOLSA	2022–2024	
Chapter V: International cooperation			
Develop tools of cooperation within the international treaties that will allow information sharing, even in cases when there are no diplomatic relations.	MFA, Prosecutor's office, Ministry of Justice	2022–2023	
Formulate the target goal and the outcomes of international cooperation, define more measurable activities.	All agencies in C-TIP	2022	
Chapter VI. Surveys, monitoring, and evaluation			
Define a M&E system with performance indicators and outcomes to be used for regular tracking of the counter-trafficking in persons and exploitation of persons NAP, map data variables and procedures between social protection and prosecution agencies.	MOLSA	2022–2023	
 Develop and review data collection tools (manual or electronic) for use by the C-TIP actors and agencies as per the monitoring indicators. Explore modalities of strengthening the data collection and management tools (paper and digital) of C-TIP data Explore across all agencies, both state and non-state. Develop a set of variables for integration into existing data collection tools and Information Systems, particularly in Social Needs Assessment Questionnaire for Children in Adversity, family need assessment 	MOLSA and other agencies	2022–2023	
 Questionnaires for case managers in Unified Social Services and Assessment tools of Community Social Workers, Employment Service Employees, etc. Analyze the need for the development of an interoperable human trafficking data collection platform, in which different systems can communicate and share 			
relevant information. Review the reporting period for timely submission of C-TIP data. Institute a quarterly reporting when agencies need to share their data with MOLSA by seventh day of the month after each quarter.	WG agencies	2022–2023	

Recommendations	Responsible Authority/Authorities	Timeline
Identify and prioritize capacity-strengthening activities for MOLSA and other actors on C-TIP data management and detail them in a M&E capacity-strengthening plan for the division.	MOLSA, other actors in C-TIP	2022–2024
Strengthen the monitoring and evaluation role in C-TIP NAP planning and implementation.	MOLSA	2022–2023
Conduct evaluation on the C-TIP cases and their outcomes for initiating required steps by relevant national agencies.		

Conclusion

The expert assessment gathered and analyzed data from primary and secondary sources to provide a comprehensive understanding of the counter-trafficking in-person NAP implementation for the period 2020–2022 in Armenia. The thematic approach using NAP chapters was applied to organize the report.

The efforts by MOLSA and GOAM to improve the legislation to fight against trafficking in and exploitation of persons are commendable as there were amendments to the law and by-laws also known as authorizing norms were submitted to the national assembly for approval.

The performance reporting on prevention of trafficking in persons and exploitation of persons' activities provided evidence that could be used to identify threats, and opportunities to combat trafficking. It also helped to sensitize the general population on means of detecting and reporting the cases. These sensitization efforts included public awareness raining through forums for the youths, use of media (TV, radio, and IECs), online platforms (websites), and social media. Training, sensitizations, and forums to increase the capacity and motivate both the state and non-state employees and institutions such as HLIB that work directly with the public were timely and reached the targeted populace during the implementation period. Ministries and government agencies collaborated to equip schoolchildren with knowledge of the risks associated with trafficking and exploitation and developed a handbook for use by C-TIP actors including the specialized police units.

Detection, protection, and support of persons subjected to trafficking and exploitation were bolstered with increased advocacy for state budget allocations to provide accommodation, in-kind assistance, restoration of documents, medical care, legal, psychological care, and other services in institutions/shelters.

The GOAM continued to strengthen its international relations to combat trafficking and exploitation through participation in various meetings, forums, and training. GOAM is dedicated to the international and regional conventions they have ratified. Engagement in international forums also provides opportunities to share the status of some of these commitments/actions to combat trafficking and exploitation.

Progress in monitoring and evaluating counter-trafficking efforts is a weak link among C-TIP actors. The statistical committee collates all the C-TIP data from all other actors. But it is not sent periodically, submission deadlines are not adhered to and in most cases, there are differentials in the number of cases reported from agency to agency, highlighting the need to harmonize data management and reporting.

Appendices

I. Case studies and the As-Is Business Process

Case study 1: Sex trafficking abroad

Mariam got an offer to work in a foreign country. She informed her mother that needs to go there and earn some money, so she can buy an apartment for her family, the mother, and her son. She left the country promising to call her family each week. Unfortunately, Mariam did not honor the promise of getting in touch with her family. The inability to reach her prompted her mother to seek for ways of reaching her. She was guided to apply to the Ombudsman office in Yerevan with the request to provide any information about her daughter with whom she had lost contact. The ombudsperson office referred the case to the Police. With the consent of the mother, Mariam's personal information was shared with an NGO working in the field of trafficking.

The police initiated operative intelligent activities, including communication with Interpol, and a preliminary investigation to find out the key actors in Armenia, who may have enrolled the presumed victim in job placement. Based on the information, the police initiated a criminal case and referred the case to the Investigative Committee under the oversight of the prosecutor's office of Armenia. The NGO in Armenia worked with another international organization and contacted the country of destination where Mariam was and with the support of Interpol, they were able to trace her.

Due to criminal proceedings, the presumed accused person (the brother of Mariam's friend) was arrested and provided information about Mariam. The local NGO in Armenia shared information with the international organization and with their support Mariam moved back to Armenia. The trial of the case lasted 3 years: the first year Mariam stayed at the shelter with her son. She got medical, legal, and psychosocial services. Mariam did not want to return to her hometown and decided to move to another community with her family. The cassation court rejected the appeal brought by the accused part sentenced them to 12 years' imprisonment. Mariam did not apply for any community support service as she was afraid her case would become known. She started to work at the bakery and did not want to be engaged in the larger community activities due to the fear and the stigma of the victimization.

Case 1: Sex trafficking case

Step 1: Mariam's mother suspects that her daughter is not doing well due to her inability to communicate home. She reports the case to Ombudsperson Armenia to help find her whereabouts.

Step 2: The ombudsperson office referred the case to the Police. Ombudsperson office was contacted as their main role is to control the balance between the legislative, executive, and judicial branches of power, observe the lawfulness of public authorities' activities as well as protect the violated rights and interests of people because of action (inaction) of government bodies and officials.

The mother consented and gave Mariam's personal information with an NGO that picked up the case to aid get her back home.

Step 3: The Police HQ Specialized Division in Yerevan initiated investigations to:

a) Categorize the case if it is trafficking or not

b) The police found it to be a trafficking case and opened criminal proceedings

c) The police transferred the case to MOLSA for the investigative commission to undertake its role

Step 4: MOLSA prepares a package for the Identification Commission to present the case for identification of the victim(s) and referral to support services.

- a) The police officer conducts a preliminary screening on the needs of the victims
- b) The investigative commission assigns an NGO to handle the case
- c) The Investigative Committee then establishes the magnitude of the case with the oversight of the prosecutor's office of Armenia

NB: The mother consented and gave Mariam's personal information with an NGO that picked up the case to aid get her back home.

Access to services: Victims are informed of the possibility to get social protection and are referred to the respective NGOs.

Step 4: The NGO identified the job agency used in Armenia and collaborated with Interpol to facilitate policing services in the destination country over the matter.

The local NGO in Armenia was in consultation with the other NGO in the destination country and collaborated to repatriate Mariam home.

Step 6: The investigation commission identified the accused (the brother of Mariam's friend) and arrested him for further investigations under criminal proceedings.

Step 7: At the prosecutor's office, the case took three years to be concluded and the accused was sentenced to 12 years imprisonment.

Services provided to Mariam during the case hearing:

- MOLSA refers the victim to an NGO running a shelter
- Legal, psycho-social, medical, and reintegration support services are provided as required
- Support to move to another town
- The duration of the service varies from one to two months to two years

Case 2: Labor Exploitation

Artyom is an 11-year-old boy, who leaves in one of the Gayane suburb of Yerevan, with his mother Maritsa, younger sister Lera, and Grandmother Ani. Artyom's family is poor, and their main income is the family pay, a monthly stipend from the state. Artyom's mom has mental health illness thus the boy didn't start school attendance at age 6. The Board of Trustees and Guardianship revealed the case when he was 8 years old. Artyom was enrolled in the after-school daycare center, where he got preschool preparation, meals, and transport to and from the center.

When Artyom was in secondary school, a social worker (Gabbatha) noted that Artyom only attended school two days a week. Artyom's grandma usually was accompanying him while visiting the center and a car was always taking him back. Gabbatha discussed the reasons for his absence with him and further suspected that the boy was missing his classes in a secondary school as well. The communication with the school principal confirmed the social worker's assumption. She reached out to the grandmother, and she confirmed that the boy was helping him with that. She cited that she had to take care of the family and the boy was helping him with that. She cited that the man who used to pick up Artyom was helping them to transport him to church after school

While speaking to the social worker at the daycare center, Artyom refused to talk and said it was forbidden to share what he was engaged in doing on the days he did not attend school. The social worker discovered that the Artyom was selling candles near the churches three days a week and from 8 AM–9 PM. As a result, Artyom was always sick, as he always stayed on the streets.

The social worker picked up the case with the police, but the police did not actively investigate the case and they did not any reason or active intervention.

Case 2: Labor exploitation of children	Services expected
Step 1: Artyom was identified by the community social worker as a child who was not attending school and was of age.	A community social worker/case manager conducts visits. They can identify vulnerable households and children who require care. They then recommend and make referrals for these children's enrollment into daycare centers. NB: Child daycare centers are institutions that identify and protect vulnerable children in the community.
Step 2: Gabbatha enrolls Artyom in the daycare center	The community social workers or the case managers undertake assessments to establish if the child is eligible to be enrolled in the daycare center. When the child is found eligible, the social worker enrolls them for meals, school preparation and funds to enable them to come to and from to the centers. NB: Daycare centers do not have standard screening tools or special skills and have not yet been considered important actors in the referral mechanism for trafficking cases.
Step 3: The daycare social worker, Gabbatha, suspected that Artyom was involved in something else and thought of conducting further investigation. Artyom was found to miss his classes in secondary school, was missing the daycare center, and was always sick.	Upon suspicion of child labor or exploitation of any nature, social workers investigate to establish the facts.
Step 4: Gabbatha, the community social worker, decided to report the case of child exploitation to the community police officers (no formal reporting is performed).	The community police officers use their judgment to determine if the case should be further investigated or dropped due to a lack of evidence. If the police find tangible evidence, they refer the case to the Unified Social Services for social assistance and to the Identification Commission at MOLSA for further investigation and prosecution.

II. Assessment tools and consent

A. Guideline for KII and expert interviews for social protection and assistance of TIP cases

Introduction:

Dear colleague,

This assessment is conducted by the USAID funded D4I Activity, implemented by Palladium, also known as Strengthening Armenia's Counter-Trafficking Monitoring System.

The objective of the assessment is to gather information on the types of trafficking cases (case categories) that different stakeholders support and define the business process of a particular case in Armenia. How these cases are handled from start to closure i.e., the business process of a particular case.

Note: this tool will be piloted with two NGOs and then will be refined for use by all the others in the planned C-TIP expert assessment.

Section A: Identification of the NGO

- 1. Name of the NGO, experience in the C-TIP field
- 2. Contact person, role in the projects regarding C-TIP

Section B: Categorization of the TIP activities

- 1. What are the predominate categories of trafficking cases in Armenia? Probe for who are the potential risk groups and/or victims?
- 2. What kind of TIP cases does you organization/NGO work with or support the GOAM in responding to?

Section C: Identification and protection of victims

1. Cases disclosure (revealed): Outline how the first response and discuss for each category (cases happening Inside Armenia)

Case Category	How is it disclosed?	How long does it take before disclosure			
	Who and what agencies are usually the first responders to disclose the case?	of the case- Average latent period?			

- 2. How is the case referred to social protection/law enforcement for identification and support?
- 3. How long does it take to identify the case through from first disclosure to official recognition by the Identification Commission?

Case Category	Referring Authority	How long does it take?

4. How does this process work for cases disclosed involving other nations/countries? What is the business process of each case (outside of Armenia)?

Case Category	Which agency In Armenia cooperates with the respective agency/ies in the receiving countries?

- 5. Where do victims stay during the investigation period? Do they have access to shelter?
- 6. Are there cases when the victims refuse to stay in the provided shelter? In the last 12 months, how many refused to be sheltered (male, female)?
- 7. Are there cases that fail to be identified as trafficking cases and are unable to get appropriate assistance? What are the main challenges in the process of revealing and identifying the cases?
- 8. For each case category what is the average time that it takes to finalize and investigate? Are protective measures applied if necessary and how?

Case Category	Average investigation time	Protective measures applied to each case category

- 9. If the case does not go to criminal proceeding, are there mechanisms for alternative investigation for administrative sanctions. What are the main reasons for ending criminal prosecution?
- 10. During the investigation, how does the investigator conduct the process? (Probe if the investigator visits the shelter, and what are the key steps from there?)
- 11. How is the participation and protection of the victim provided during court hearings?
- 12. Do the case categories identified above (Section B) receive any other compensation or monetary support from (the government)?
- 13. Is there a limit on the duration of the victim protection measures taken by the NGOs/state agencies?

Section D: Return and reintegration of victims

- 14. Is there a re-integration plan for the victim if they stay in the shelter? Is there an approved and adopted reintegration mechanism?
- 15. What actors are involved in the process of re-integration?

Case Category	Actors involved

- 16. What are the challenges during the re-integration period?
- 17. When is the case considered closed and completed?

- 18. Are the perpetrators usually convicted? When is the perpetrator not convicted is there a risk for further victimization? Are these risks considered while closing the case?
- 19. Have you ever come across cases of re-victimization?

What are some of your suggestions and/or remedies that can be used to improve C-TIP response?

B. Informed consent form KII

Hello, my name is ______. I am national consultant for the Project: Strengthening Armenia's Counter-Trafficking Monitoring System with support from USAID D4I conducting counter trafficking in person (C-TIP) expert interviews.

The overall purpose of the Expert Assessment is to support the national MOLSA and C-TIP actors in Armenia to conduct a comprehensive assessment of the counter-trafficking National Action Plan (NAP) implementation and its M&E system and to design an operational mechanism for evidence-based strategy development.

The guides and questionnaires developed specifically for this assessment follow strict ethical standards and ethical considerations for information confidentiality and ethical considerations.

We would very much appreciate your consent to conduct an interview with you. The survey is confidential, your answers will be used in an aggregated manner.

The interview will take approximately 45 minutes, and we guarantee that your responses will not be shared with public or other parties but will be used only for the intended purposes as per assessment objective. The information you provide will be separated from your personal identifiers, such as your name and other contacts. In order not to not to miss out on anything during our conversation for further analysis, I would request for your consent to record the interview.

Participation in the interview is voluntary.

We thank you in advance for participating in this interview.

I acknowledge being informed on the information above _____ (Name, signature)

I agree to participate in the interview _____ (Name, signature)

I agree that the opinion I express during the interview is quoted without mentioning my name.

_____ (Name, signature)

C. Group Participatory tool: The 2020–2022 NAP monitoring tool

USAID PATAFORCE									
	Chapter I. Impro	ving the l	egislation	to fight against traf	ficking in and exploitation	n of persons			
	Responsible and cooperating entities	Deadline	Potential sources of funding	Expected outcomes	Evaluation indicators	Status- Dec 2021: Completed, In progress, Delayed, Cancelled	Score (autopopulate)	Description / Process	Recor steps
Objective 1. Improving the legislation and ensuring its enfor	eability, strengthening t	the institution	al mechanisms						
1 Develop recommendations aimed at introducing the term "forced labor" in the RoA Labor Code and create mechanisms to enforce it.		2021	No funding is required.	The process for detecting forced labor cases and identifying victims will be improved.	The RoA Law amending and supplementing the Labor Code has been adopted.	Delayed	2		1.To ac adoptic 2.Sepa Traffick Labour 3.Clarif "vulnera means
Victims Identification Commission, and adopt the draft RoA Government Decree amending and supplementing Government Decree 1200-N (dated 15 October 2015) on Amending and Supplementing the Government Decree that defines the form of the report presented by the Trafficking and Exploitation Victims Identification Commission to the Republic of Armenia Council for Fighting Trafficking in and Exploitation of Persons.	RoA Ministry of Labor and Social Issues, RoA Winistry of Justice; RoA mestigative Committee (subject to consent), RoA General Prosecution Office (subject to consent); Health and _abor Inspectorate	Q4- 2021	No funding is required.	The work of the Commission will be improved.	The draft RoA Government Decree amending and supplementing Government Decree 1200-N (dated 15 October 2015) has been submitted to the RoA Prime Minister's Office.	Completed	4		
trafficking and exploitation victims that have committed a crime during such trafficking and exploitation, irrespective of the gravity	RoA Ministry of Justice, RoA Investigative Committee (subject to CTIP Legislatio	Q4, 2020	No funding is required.	Improving the current legislation in line with the international commitments of	The review and the analysis have been performed, and the recommendations have been drafted. vention of TIF (+) :		FALSE	completed in 2020	

USAID Mipact	Chapter VI. Surveys, monitoring, and evaluation								
Measures/Activities/Tasks in the 2020- 2022 NAP	Responsible and cooperating entities		Potential sources of funding	Expected outcomes			Score (autopopulate)	Description / Process	Recommendation/ next step
Provide information to the Trafficking and Exploitation Victims Identification Commission on the outcome of criminal cases initiated in connection with crimes of trafficking in and exploitation of persons.			required.	comprehensive, and updated statistics are available.	Statistics are available on the number and progress of criminal cases initiated in connection with facts of trafficking.	In progress		authorized and do not have such authority to provide information to the identification commission. B. From the Prosecutor's Office The information is provided annually to the Ministry of Labor and	 Design a unified tool for data cc 2. Consolidate information provisis quarter unit the 7th of the month 3. to establish a legal provision if Committee, National Security Ser obliged to to transfer information commission, to start doing that. From the Prosecutors office 4. Conduct research, data collect outcome of court cases
Clarify the profile of persons subjected to trafficking in and exploitation of persons, as well as the perpetrators of these crimes, as per data collected about them and analyzed (age and sex breakdown, status, social status, form of exploitation, place (origin/target country), and other data).			required.	and reasons for trafficking of persons	The social-demographic profile of persons subjected to trafficking and exploitation is available.	Completed		Receipt, elaboration and summary of statistical reports as approved by the decisions of the State Council of Statistics 1. General	MOLSA 1. Develop a unified database to , responsible body as per their ma 2. Implement data analysis capad

Data for Impact

University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill 123 West Franklin Street, Suite 330 Chapel Hill, NC 27516 USA Phone: 919-445-9350 | Fax: 919-445-9353

D4l@unc.edu

http://www.data4impactproject.org



This publication was produced with the support of the United States Agency for International Development (USAID) under the terms of the Data for Impact (D4I) associate award 7200AA18LA00008, which is implemented by the Carolina Population Center at the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill, in partnership with Palladium International, LLC; ICF Macro, Inc.; John Snow, Inc.; and Tulane University. The views expressed in this publication do not necessarily reflect the views of USAID or the United States government.

TR-22-487 D4I

